PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

SONAL N. MEHTA (SBN 222086)
sonal.mehta@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
2600 El Camino Real, Suite 400
Palo Alto, CA 94306
Telephone: (650) 858-6000

TAYLOR GOOCH (SBN 294282)
taylor.gooch@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
50 California Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (628) 235-1000

JARED V. GRUBOW (*Pro Hac Vice)*
jared.grubow@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
250 Greenwich Street
New York, NY 10007
Telephone: (212) 230-8800

LOUIS W. TOMPROS (*Pro Hac Vice*)
louis.tompros@wilmerhale.com
DISHA PATEL (*Pro Hac Vice*)
disha.patel@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Telephone: (617) 526-6000

ARI HOLTZBLATT (SBN 354361)
ari.holtzblatt@wilmerhale.com
ROBIN C. BURRELL (*Pro Hac Vice*)
robin.burrell@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
2100 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20037
Telephone: (202) 663-6000

Attorneys for Defendant
ANTHROPIC PBC

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

SAN JOSE DIVISION

CONCORD MUSIC GROUP, INC., ET AL.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

ANTHROPIC PBC,

Defendant.

Case No. 5:24-cv-03811-EKL-SVK

ANTHROPIC PBC'S MOVING SEPARATE STATEMENT IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
Anthropic's Use Of Lyrics As Inputs To Train Claude Is Fair Use		
Issue 1: The Use of Lyrics as Inputs to Training is Fair Use as Matter of Law	Fact 1: Musician and rapper, Meek Mill, uses Claude to help him understand and manage the administrative aspects of his music career. Ex. 145 (MeekMill (@Mill) Twitter (Mar. 23, 2026), https://x.com/MeekMill/status/2036107917095469093)[1]	
	Fact 2: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, testified that Anthropic was founded to "form an organization that would focus more fully on safe and beneficial AI development." Kaplan testified that his Anthropic co-founders were "Chris Olah, Jack Clark, Sam McCandlish, Tom Brown, Dario Amodei, and Daniela [Amodei]." Ex. 120 (Kaplan Dep.) at 62:18-71:16	
	Fact 3: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, testified that "the overall view of the founders in 2021, I would say, was strongly against commercialization, and towards the idea that we would effectively never pursue it, and that we might be funded primarily by philanthropists in perpetuity." Ex. 120 (Kaplan Dep.) at 115:11-16	
	Fact 4: Anthropic co-founder and President, Ms. Daniela Amodei, testified "when we first founded the company in 2021, we were primarily focused on research at that time, and we always theorized that had we would have, you know, potential commercial applications for the models down the road." Ex. 111 (Daniela Amodei Dep.) at 120:8-12	
	Fact 5: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown, testified that "[i]nitially we weren't sure if we were even going to commercialize anything, and so we had kind of a long soul-searching process." Ex. 106 (Brown Dep.) at 65:10-12	

[1] Unless otherwise specified citations to 'Ex.' are exhibits attached to the Burrell Declaration in support of Anthropic's Motion for Summary Judgment and Opposition to Publishers' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment filed concurrently herewith.

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 6: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Benjamin Mann, testified "So one of Anthropic's principles is what we call the race to the top. Our hope is that by showing that we, as one of the frontier labs, can prioritize both safety and capabilities at the same time, that we can put pressure on our competitors to also prioritize safety." Ex. 124 (Mann 30(b)(1) Dep. Vol. 2) at 188:18-189:16	
	Fact 7: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, testified that Anthropic's status as a public benefit corporation allows it to prioritize its mission above its profit motive. Ex. 120 (Kaplan Dep.) at 106:5-24	
	Fact 8: Anthropic's certificate of incorporation states "The specific public benefit that the Corporation will promote is to responsibly develop and maintain advanced AI for the cultural, social and technological improvement of humanity." Ex. 88 (Anthropic_0000570401) at -402	
	Fact 9: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested that Claude is trained to be both helpful and harmless. Dkt. 212-5 ("Kaplan PI Decl.") at ¶¶ 39-41	
	Fact 10: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported: "Text-generative LLMs like Claude are a class of generative AI that are trained on and mimic natural human language in their written outputs." And that "LLMs like Claude analyze the statistical relationship or conditional probability of tokenized words and phrases and are taught to generate written outputs based on preceding context. In the case of LLMs like Claude, the outputs are texts that appear natural and coherent, generated in response to human inputs." Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶ 19	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 11: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "generative AI systems are trained on very large datasets of content according to the form of content they are intended to generate and input they are designed to accept." He also testified "Claude's training appears to be consistent with the general description above." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶¶ 23, 55	
	Fact 12: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "LLMs are autoregressive transformers that extract probabilities between words and contextual cues, in order to predict words, phrases and larger pieces of text." Ex. 18 (Zhao Rebuttal) at ¶130	
	Fact 13: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested that "LLMs are text-based generative AI models that use deep learning techniques and train on extremely large data sets to understand, summarize, generate, and predict new content." He also attested "Anthropic is an artificial intelligence safety and research company based in San Francisco, California, working to develop generative AI models." Claude was released to the general public in July 2023. Kaplan PI Decl. ¶¶ 6, 7, 8	
	Fact 14: Claude has been used for various tasks by pharmaceutical researchers, scientists, and government agencies. Ex. 1 (Altman Report) at ¶¶ 54-116	
	Fact 15: Anthropic co-founder and President, Ms. Daniela Amodei, testified that "Research and Development, Healthcare, and Life Sciences" are among "the most common use cases of Claude." Ex. 111 (Daniela Amodei Dep.) at 116:10-117:2, 154:4-15, 197:8-17	
	Fact 16: A December 2024 report of aggregated insights across a random sample of consumer (i.e., non-business) users' Claude conversations shows that the most popular consumer use cases for Claude were "web	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	and mobile application development assistance" (>10%),"content creation and communication assistance across disciplines" (~9%), "multidisciplinary academic research and writing assistance" (~7%), "education and career development assistance" (~6%), "implement and optimize diverse advanced AI/ML technologies and applications creation" (~6%), "business strategy and operations assistance across industries" (~6%), "multilingual N[atural] L[anguage] P[rocessing], translation, and linguistic analysis services" (~4.5%), "DevOps and cloud infrastructure implementation and troubleshooting" (~4%), "digital marketing and SEO optimization assistance" (~4%), and "data analysis, visualization, and management assistance" (~4%). The top ten use cases collectively account for roughly 60% of Claude conversations. Ex. 47 (Anthropic_0000012987) at -994	
	Fact 17: Claude has been used to analyze data for clinical trials and to draft clinical study reports for medical treatments. Ex. 1 (Altman Report) at ¶ 76; Ex. 87 (Anthropic_0000570252) at -253	
	Fact 18: Claude has been applied to help compose lyrics by brainstorming interesting word pairings. Ex. 1 (Altman Report) at ¶ 111; Ex. 98 (Anthropic_0000594977) at -982	
Issue 2: Using Lyrics to Train LLMs is Transformative	Fact 19: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported: "[G]enerative AI strives to generate content by combining existing materials together using patterns it derives from training materials. It utilizes complex machine learning architectures to extract correlation patterns between a textual prompt or request, and specific content samples (which can be text, images, or audio) that match those prompts. These models extract from training data the likelihood of a particular sequence of tokens (response) that follow other sequences of tokens (user prompt), captured and represented in layers and layers of conditional probabilities. Sufficient training on large datasets (including much of all human writing that has ever been written), produces the generative model, the encapsulation of a massive compilation of correlations	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	between text prompts and content, stored as layers and layers of conditional probabilities." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 13	
	Fact 20: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested: "To build an LLM like Claude, engineers first develop a 'neural network,' which is a computer program capable of studying enormous datasets of text and extracting statistical and linguistic information about those texts in an effort to gain a generalized understanding of human language." He also attested: "The neutral network is shown a vast dataset consisting of hundreds of millions, if not billions, of pieces of content. This set of materials is known collectively as the 'training corpus' or simply the 'corpus.'" Kaplan PI Decl. ¶¶ 17, 18	
	Fact 21: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested: "The neural network then analyzes each token in the context of surrounding tokens to learn language patterns and the relationship between the words and phrases in the corpus. Through iterative training on large amounts of data, the neural network discovers patterns among words and phrases, extracting statistical information to develop a probabilistic but comprehensive map of how language works, without explicit human-defined rules. The model stores this statistical information in an organized set of numerical values called parameters, which include weights and biases (representing the connective strengths among neurons)." Kaplan PI Decl. ¶ 20	
	Fact 22: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported: "A large and diverse training corpus exposes the LLM to a variety of language patterns, allowing the LLM to learn from and model diverse sentence structures, topics, grammar, and other nuances. Training on diverse datasets provides models with more complete and comprehensive probabilities for different token patterns representing data and information in different contexts, which generally lead to more flexible, useful, and coherent outputs."	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶ 21; Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 125:10-128:6 (Dr. Shan's testimony affirming the accuracy of the above statement from his report).	
	Fact 23: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported: "Anthropic uses training data to train its models for the purpose of mapping out statistical relationships between text fragments so that the LLM models can generate new texts." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 36	
	Fact 24: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported: "[W]hile LLMs can perform complex tasks such as summarizing information and generating code, they do not function similarly to databases or search engines." And that "LLMs do not store or retrieve passages of text verbatim. Instead, they generate new and different outputs, probabilistically, based on general statistical patterns and relationships learned during training that are represented in the model's weights. Because their outputs are drawn from probability distributions, LLMs can produce different results when generating outputs in response to the same prompt, particularly when the final text is produced by randomly sampling from those distributions, which is by far the most common approach to LLM generation." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 98	
	Fact 25: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that "one of the purpose of lyrics is—and one of its primary intended use purposes is to enjoy words to a song." He answered, "I guess, in general, yes" to the question "When you listen to a piece of music, is the intended purpose for listening to that piece of music to enjoy it?" Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 352:23-353:16	
	Fact 26: Music compositions communicate the artistic expression of a musician or songwriter with an audience and to entertain. Ex. 137 (Stokes Dep.) at 230:11-18, 231:8-232:5; Ex. 26 (Stokes Reply) at ¶¶ 13-19	
	Fact 27: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that Claude's "training corpus is decoupled from the model once the model is trained"; that Claude does not "stor[e]	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	an exact copy of that text"; and that "the model does not scan for the text from its training corpus." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 177:2-4, 178:6-18, 179:9-10	
	Fact 28: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported "The model has not memorized the specific text in the sense of literally storing an exact copy of that text." Ex. 18 (Zhao Rebuttal) at ¶ 11	
	Fact 29: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported: "Anthropic uses training data to train its models for the purpose of mapping out statistical relationships between text fragments so that the LLM models can generate new texts." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 36	
	Fact 30: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported: "[W]eights are one type of model parameter for an NN [neural network]. Weights are the adjustable values in the model that model training seeks to optimize. Weight tuning is a subprocess of model training where the weights of an NN are adjusted iteratively using the training data so that the model's predictions better align with the expected outputs." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 52	
	Fact 31: Tokenizing text breaks it into small, standard units, identified numerically, that a large language model can process. Tokens are then transformed into richer numerical representations in "embeddings," which encode a token's meaning and semantic relationship to other tokens. Token embeddings are learned parameters that evolve during model training, and as the model processes billions of data points, mathematically move closer to other tokens that appear in similar contexts. Embeddings capture the relationship between words, making mathematical reasoning about those words' meanings possible. Embeddings are then positionally encoded so that a model can recognize both what each word means and where it occurs in context, rather than simply storing text verbatim. Tokens, embeddings, and positional encoding allow models to	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	understand the contextual relationship of words represented numerically. Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶¶ 141-152	
	Fact 32: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported: "Through pre-training, the model will learn which of these is the best choice from context. Pre-training also involves 'weighting' the dataset. In this process, the trainer directs the model to use some parts of the dataset more often than others due to differences in perceived quality of the material, with portions engaged multiple times and others not at all. Ultimately, the model will learn the most common patterns in the grammar, syntax, and semantics of a given language. This process requires no supervision (i.e., labeling or metadata describing the contents of the text). Rather, the model recognizes patterns in the training data to infer these rules automatically." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 20	
	Fact 33: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported, "Claude, like all LLMs, does not rely on an inherent understanding of truth or facts in the same way humans do." And that Anthropic has trained Claude to "generate[] output based on learning statistical associations between tokenized text." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 141	
	Fact 34: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that "[i]t is possible" that "there are going to be instances in which when it's ask[ed] for something that's not very simple, Claude will output different outputs in response to identical prompts, even at the same time." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 247:7-13	
	Fact 35: LLMs process a user's prompt and draw on learned language patterns to stochastically output the next predicted word. Model builders control the level of stochasticity (or randomness) in the output, including through a parameter called the "temperature parameter." As the temperature increases, so does the randomness of the output. This is unlike a database or retrieval system, which deterministically fetch and return the same result for the same query. This makes it	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	possible for LLM's to generate outputs that are linguistically and textually different while containing similar factual content. Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶¶ 271, 280-285 & Figure 33	
	Fact 36: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "The model has not memorized the specific text in the sense of literally storing an exact copy of that text, and it does not strictly refer back to and fetch that sequence from its training corpus when it regurgitates. A pretrained model does not scan for text from its training corpus and reproduce what it finds when asked." When asked in his deposition whether he "stand[s] by that statement," Zhao answered, "Yes, the model does not scan for the text from its training corpus and produce it exactly." Ex. 18 (Zhao Rebuttal) at ¶ 11; Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 178:4-18	
	Fact 37: Anthropic displays a webpage titled, "Build With Claude," which markets "Use Cases for Claude" to enterprise clients. Those use cases include: "Coding" where its "latest model, Claude Opus 4.1, can complete complex engineering tasks to solve problems that would typically take a full day of engineering work"; "Agents," offering "superior instruction following, tool selection, error correction, and advanced reasoning for customer-facing agents and complex AI workflows"; "Productivity" where "Claude can extract relevant information from business emails and documents, categorize and summarize survey responses, and wrangle reams of text with high speed and accuracy"; and "Customer Support." Ex. 63 (Anthropic_0000437208)	
	Fact 38: Anthropic's 30(b)(6) witness, Dr. Deep Ganguli, testified: "[T]he main use case of CLAUDE.AI and CLAUDE Code and our CLAUDE API is for writing code. It's for doing software engineering tasks. That is the most common use case across—across the product surfaces I mentioned." Ex. 119 (Ganguli 30(b)(6) Dep.) at 67:7-15	
	Fact 39: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified: "LLMs, one of the use case is, as we describe, a user go	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	to Claude.ai or .com to use the service but if I understand correctly, that is a fraction of how LLMs are used today" and "Claude is also used as a reasoning systems or an agent, where, you know, user ask original task, but Claude will generate command and prompt itself to do a step-by-step educate—execution of the task." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 95:22-96:17	
	Fact 40: Anthropic's 30(b)(6) witness, Jane Leibrock, testified: "We promote CLAUDE's safety as a model, its accuracy, its high intelligence, its skill at working with a large amount of knowledge by which we mean data that's been provided by the user to the model, its ability to show its chain of thought or reasoning to do deep research, and to work with software code or to debug code." Ex. 122 (Leibrock Dep.) at 26:14-27:4	
	Fact 41: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Executive Officer, Dario Amodei, testified: "Anthropic, it's very focused on code. It's very focused on work and productivity-based activities. So Anthropic has deliberately made—made choices not to—not to produce output in many creative modalities." *See* Ex. 112 (Dario Amodei Dep.) at 102:19-24	
	Fact 42: Anthropic co-founder and President, Ms. Daniela Amodei, testified that Anthropic "serve[s] about 300,000 businesses." Ex. 111 (Daniela Amodei Dep.) at 68:7-9	
	Fact 43: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown, testified "we want Claude to be the best model for people who want to do work, particularly coding work." He also testified "We have—we have really focused on work rather than the consumer application" of Claude. He testified "we have always wanted to prioritize data that makes the model good at work." Ex. 106 (Brown Dep.) at 48:17-21, 64:4-8, 64:12-16, 64:23-65:4, 86:3-7, 94:11-16	
	Fact 44: Anthropic co-founder Tom Brown used Claude to explore how to write his wife a song for Valentine's	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Day given his wife's taste for Adele's music. In the course of the conversation, Claude explained: "Since you mentioned Adele's influence, we could focus on emotional storytelling and specific details that make it personal to your relationship. Adele often structures her songs with … [i]ntimate verses that tell a story[,] [a] build-up to an emotional chorus[,] [b]ridge sections that add depth[,] [and] [p]owerful vocal movements." Ex. 95 (Anthropic_0000570705)	
	Fact 45: Anthropic co-founder Tom Brown asked Claude, "What are your favorite pearl jam tracks?" In response, Claude listed five songs, including "Black." Claude explained that "Black" "captures that devastating moment when you realize someone you love has moved on completely while you're still consumed by the relationship," and "[t]he raw emotion in Vedder's voice during the outro ('I know someday you'll have a beautiful life...') creates one of rock's most heartbreaking moments." Ex. 92 (Anthropic_0000570614)	
	Fact 46: Claude has recommended and discussed musical compositions with users based on their music taste. Anthropic's President, Ms. Daniela Amodei, asked Claude for suggestions of classical music that is "meaningful but positive / uplifting," Claude responded with a list of ten musical works. It then explained: "Beethoven's 'Ode to Joy' is a powerful anthem of brotherhood and joy. Handel's 'Hallelujah Chorus' is jubilant and celebratory. Mozart's 'Eine kleine Nachtmusik' is light and cheerful, while Vivaldi's 'Spring' from The Four Seasons evokes the rebirth and energy of springtime." Ex. 96 (Anthropic_0000570712) at -713	
	Fact 47: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Benjamin Mann, asked Claude "What's the story behind the song dancing in the moonlight" and Claude explained that "The song was originally written and recorded by French-American songwriter and musician Sherman Kelly in 1969 when he was part of a band called Boffalongo." Claude continued that "The song emerged as a direct contrast to the violence [Kelly] had experienced" "while vacationing on the Caribbean	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	island of St. Croix" to "create[] a vision of a peaceful, harmonious world where people came together in joy rather than violence." "The uplifting, almost utopian lyrics of the song ('Everybody's dancing in the moonlight…') represents his yearning for a more peaceful existence after facing such brutality." Ex. 90 (Anthropic_0000570582)	
	Fact 48: Anthropic technical staff, Mr. Ben Kuhn, asked Claude for "some good three-part choral music for two friends" and Claude "recommend[ed] some three-part choral music that would work well for sightreading with friends" including "Pelstrina's 'Sicut Cervus'" "Orlando di Lasso's 'Matona, mia cara'" "Schubert's 'Sanctus'" "Avro Pärt's simpler works like 'Morning Star'" "Eric Whitacre's 'Seal Lullaby'" and more, categorizing them by "different difficulty levels and styles." Ex. 89 (Anthropic_0000570574)	
	Fact 49: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown, asked Claude about Jimi Hendrix and the "wah wah" pedal, and Claude responded that "Hendrix helped popularize the wah-wah pedal in the late 1960s, using it to great effect on songs like 'Voodoo Child (Slight Return)' and 'All Along the Watchtower.'" Claude continued that "The pedal essentially became an extension of the instrument, allowing players to 'voice' their guitar in new ways." Ex. 94 (Anthropic_0000570704)	
	Fact 50: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown, asked Claude about Joni Mitchell's "Both Sides Now" and why he "like[s] it despite it being something that I wouldn't have liked in my twenties." Claude responded that "The emotional complexity and introspective lyrics of 'Both Sides Now' might resonate more deeply now that you've had more life experience. The song is fundamentally about seeing things from multiple perspectives and understanding life's contradictions—themes that often become more meaningful as we gain life experience." When Mr. Brown asked why he "might have dismissed [other music] which are actually good[] Especially things from the 80s?" Claude responded that "The 1980s are particularly interesting	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	because they often get dismissed for their production style (lots of synthesizers, gated reverb on drums, sometimes 'cheesy' by modern standards) or theatrical presentation" before listing artists like "Kate Bush" "Peter Gabriel" "Tears for Fears" and "The Eurythmics" that bore thematic similarities to Joni Mitchell. The conversation then discusses more modern artists whose "content and wisdom" align with Mitchell's and Claude discusses how Kendrick Lamar's lyrics in " 'Mother I sober' where he says 'I'm sensitive, I feel everything, I feel everybody / One man standing on two words, healing and hurt' – which suggests he's found some path toward healing while acknowledging the hurt is still there." Other Anthropic employees asked Claude to: • help put together a book of song lyrics, • explain the meaning of Stephen Sondheim's "Pacific Overtures," • explain the meaning behind the song "Every Breath You Take by the Police," to which Claude responded "The lyrics … reveal the narrator's controlling and stalking behavior toward someone who has left them.… The song's dark themes are somewhat masked by its melodic, gentle musical arrangement." • explain the story behind Bob Dylan's "Mr. Tambourine Man" and Cat Steven's "Wild World." • to ask for "some song to sing" to a "newborn son" because "m[y] dad sang James Taylor's 'Carolina on my mind'" and Claude gave recommendations on "wonderful options for singing to you son." Ex. 93 (Anthropic_0000570681); Ex. 147 (Anthropic_0000570572); Ex. 148 (Anthropic_0000570592); Ex. 149 (Anthropic_0000570627); Ex. 150 (Anthropic_0000570635); Ex. 151 (Anthropic_0000570636)	
Issue 3: The Second Factor Favors Fair	Fact 51: Musical compositions and lyrics can be creative, expressive works.	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
Use Because Song Lyrics are Freely and Publicly Available	Ex. 137 (Stokes Dep.) at 68:9-16, 224:21-24	
	Fact 52: In response to the question "Consumers expect to be able to get lyrics online for free, right?" 30(b)(6) Representative for UMPG, Mr. David Kokakis, testified "I know that's how we see most lyrics-based digital services offering lyrics to consumers." Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 250:8-253:13	
	Fact 53: In response to the question "Is there any website that you have gone to to view the lyrics for particular songs?" 30(b)(6) Representative for Concord, Mr. Duff Berschback, testified "I'll sometimes use Genius and sometimes do just a simple Google search, both of which are -- have been licensed by Concord." And in response to the question "So with respect to genius.com, for example, anyone could go online and view the lyrics to any of Concord's works that are included on genius.com?" 30(b)(6) Representative for Concord, Mr. Duff Berschback, testified "Yes." Ex. 104 (Berschback Dep.) at 122:24-123:16	
Issue 4: The Third Factor Favors Fair Use Because Only the Portion of The Works Reasonably Necessary to Achieve a Transformative Purpose Is Used	Fact 54: Publishers admit that "the copyrighted musical compositions for which they own and control exclusive rights, including the Asserted Works, include music and lyrics." Ex. 27 (Pls.' Resp. & Obj. to Def.'s 2nd Set of Req. For Admis. (Nos. 16-24) (Sept. 2, 2025)) at 9	
	Fact 55: 30(b)(6) Representative for UMPG, Mr. David Kokakis, testified [redacted] Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 85:9-87:14	
	Fact 56: When asked "ABKCO does not have separate copyrights to the lyrics for any of the songs identified in the ABKCO song list, right?" 30(b)(6) Representative for ABKCO, Ms. Alisa Coleman, answered "Correct." Ex. 110 (Coleman Dep.) at 49:22-50:6	
	Fact 57: When asked "[redacted]?" 30(b)(6)	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Representative for UMPG, Mr. Duff Berschback, testified "[redacted]." Ex. 104 (Berschback Dep.) at 30:24-31:7	
	Fact 58: When asked "[redacted]" 30(b)(6) Representative for CCMG, Mr. Draughon, testified "[redacted]." He also testified [redacted] Ex. 117 (Draughon Dep.) at 50:13-17, 51:10-18	
	Fact 59: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported "to acquire these sufficiently large training corpora, developers often turn to a massive source of easily accessible text: the Internet." He testified "The largest portion of [Claude's] training data consists of 'Common Crawl' data. Common Crawl is a collection of website crawls from 2008 to the present, including raw web pages as well as corresponding metadata and text extractions." Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶¶ 22, 45(i)	
	Fact 60: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffery Bilmes, reported that publicly available information indicates Anthropic's Claude models were trained in part on data sourced from Common Crawl or by directly crawling the web. Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶¶ 102-103, 107	
	Fact 61: Publishers' Expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported "Anthropic has copied the lyrics to a huge number of Publishers' musical compositions and used those copies as input to train Claude." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 10	
	Fact 62: Publishers' Expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported "Anthropic trains its Claude AI models using certain datasets—including Common Crawl, OpenWebText2, The Pile, YouTube Subtitles, and Reddit data—that contain Publishers' lyrics."	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶ 44	
	Fact 63: In response to the question "[redacted]" 30(b)(6) Representative for CCMG, Mr. Draughon, testified [redacted]" Ex. 117 (Draughon Dep.) at 136:21-137:2	
	Fact 64: Audio files and data are not supported by Claude models and thus are not incorporated in the models' training data. Ex. 11 (Bilmes Rebuttal) at ¶ 239	
	Fact 65: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported "[r]egardless of their specific task or architecture, generative AI systems are trained on very large datasets of content." He reported that "[t]he larger the corpus on which a model is trained, the more effective and reliable its results will be as a general matter." Ex. 18 (Zhao Report) at ¶¶ 22, 23	
	Fact 66: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested that "[t]rillions of tokens are required to properly train an LLM like Claude and to ultimately allow the LLM to recognize patterns in language to any useful degree." Kaplan PI Decl. ¶ 22	
	Fact 67: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified "[Y]es," that it was accurate that "LLM developers like Anthropic seek to train LLMs like Claude on a vast training corpus of human written texts often comprising of terabytes or petabytes of data and hundreds of billions or trillions of tokens." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 125:10-128:6	
	Fact 68: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, agreed that "song lyrics are available on the internet through a number of different sites," testifying that "they are available in different forms, different places." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 276:19-25	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 69: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that to "acquire these sufficiently large training corpora, developers often to turn to a massive source of easily accessible text: the Internet. Developers typically source large portions of their training corpora by scraping text from webpages, a process by which bots 'crawl' through the internet and copy the contents of webpages it encounters. Developers may also acquire datasets constructed by third parties, such as 'Common Crawl,'" 'The Pile,' and 'OpenWebText2,' which are themselves largely comprised of petabytes of content scraped from the Internet." Dr. Shan also reported that "Web crawling is an automated process by which bots copy the contents of webpages they come across on the Internet." Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶¶ 22-23	
	Fact 70: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeff Bilmes, reported "Without large text collections like Common Crawl and other large-scale web crawling efforts, it would be very difficult to obtain sufficient data for the types of advanced deep LLM training that has made general purpose LLMs like Claude possible." And that "Developers typically meet their data requirements by gathering training data from several sources, including large publicly available text corpora like Common Crawl and OpenWebText. Common Crawl and OpenWebText contain textual information extracted from millions of webpages over time." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶¶ 100, 102	
	Fact 71: Claude Sonnet 3.0 was trained on [redacted] exceeds more than twice [redacted] of the text of all the books in the world. Ex. 6 (Nagaraj Report) at ¶¶ 36-37; Kaplan PI Decl. ¶¶ 29-30; Ex. 56 (Anthropic_0000231226)	
	Fact 72: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that "the data collection happens across many years, including sourcing from Common Crawl" and "data sharks." He also testified "based on my inspection, there are large amount of work in suit as part of internet data."	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 232:5-233:4, 343:2-22, 344:1-16	
	Fact 73: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that "Anthropic has gotten training data from a number of sources" such as "web archives, YouTube video transcriptions, Common Crawl in the past." When asked whether he "understand[s] that song lyrics are widely available on the internet through a number of different sites," Dr. Zhao responded that he understands that song lyrics "are available in different forms, different places." Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that "Anthropic trains its Claude AI models using certain datasets—including Common Crawl, OpenWebText2, The Pile, YouTube Subtitles, and Reddit data—that contain Publishers' lyrics" that CommonCrawl "represents a massive indiscriminate scrape of the public web" and that "OpenWebText2" is "a generalized web scrape dataset." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 274:20-275:7, 276:19-277:4, 279:8-280:3, 282:2-21; Ex. 7 (Shan Report) ¶¶ 44-45	
	Fact 74: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported that Anthropic's general-purpose web crawler is designed to respect internet protocols that tell web crawlers not to crawl or scrape those web pages. Dr. Bilmes analyzed Anthropic's web crawling data and found that Anthropic collected lyrics to the works-in-suit from [redacted] million public web pages and adhered to the internet protocol rules in place at the time those web pages were crawled. Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at § VII.A	
Issue 5: Factor Four Favors Fair Use Because The Transformative Use Outweighs Any	Fact 75: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, reported that he categorized 624 outputs as "Output contains lyrics (no copyright Guardrail noted)" and 31 outputs as "Output contains lyrics and copyright Guardrail noted." Ex. 21 (Dennis Reply) at ¶ 14	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
Marketplace Harms	Fact 76: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, identified only 2 outputs after November 12, 2023 (when Anthropic strengthened its guardrails in response to this lawsuit) that were related to the works in suit. The longest of the outputs Publishers' expert Mr. Joshua Dennis identifies at Rebuttal Rpt. ¶ 88 contained 16 words of a work in suit. Ex. 13 (Dennis Rebuttal) at ¶ 88	
	Fact 77: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Andrew Bray, found that 83.33% of the prompts in the 5 million sample were made using credentials known to belong to Publishers' known investigator. Publishers have not disclosed identifying information for all of the prompts and outputs generated by Publishers, their attorneys, or their investigators, so it is possible that Publishers and their agents generated all of the prompts within the 5 million sample that sought lyrics to works in suit. Ex. 20 (Bray Reply) at ¶ 11	
	Fact 78: UMPG 30(b)(6) Representative, Mr. David Kokakis, acknowledged that "AI has a lot of beneficial applications." Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 337:11-12	
	Fact 79: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that "There are benefits to multiple types of AI. And even for a more constrained definition of generative AI, I do believe that there are scenarios where they have some benefit." Dr. Zhao also testified that "there are certain applications where, even by speculation or reasoning about AI's functionality, that it would prove to be positive and useful." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 399:23-400:2, 401:5-8	
	Fact 80: When asked, "[redacted]" 30(b)(6) Representative for Concord, Mr. Duff Berschback, testified "[redacted]" *See* Ex. 104 (Berschback Dep.) at 141:5-12	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 81: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis testified "I am aware that the regulators use AI and that may be of some benefit to them"; "I am certainly aware that companies use AI as part of their compliance program in certain instances, yes"; "I think, in my experience, and as we've seen, AI can analyze a large amount of data. I think that's a fair characterization"; and "It depends on the nature of the case, but we certainly use AI for certain aspects of certain investigation." Ex. 115 (Dennis Dep.) at 285:1-287:1	
	Fact 82: 30(b)(6) Representative for UMPG, Mr. David Kokakis, testified "If done responsibly and in a controlled and licensed fashion, then absolutely I agree and feel today that AI can be a valuable tool for songwriters and artists." When asked "AI can also have benefits outside of the music industry, right?" Mr. Kokakis testified, "Absolutely, yes." Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 336:12-337:22	
	Fact 83: During a March 5, 2026 Earnings Call, Mr. Michael Nash, Executive Vice President and Chief Digital Officer of UMG, stated "When you take into consideration the significant opportunities to commercialize AI innovation through new products and services that Lucian [Grainge, UMG CEO] outlined and the empirical data demonstrating insignificant and comprehensively mitigated risk, thoughtful analysis will conclude that the impact AI will have on our business will be overwhelmingly net positive." And that "we're seeing no indication that AI royalty dilution is a material issue for UMG from a revenue perspective." Ex. 136 (UMG Earnings Call Tr.) at 23:37	
	Fact 84: A case study published on Anthropic's website describes how the Tahoe Lead Removal Project used Claude for research to support its removal of six miles of toxic lead cables from Lake Tahoe. Ex. 86 (Anthropic_0000570166) at -166	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 85: An article published by The Information describes how Pfizer and Novo Nordisk have used Claude to help analyze clinical study data and prepare clinical study reports. Ex. 87 (Anthropic_0000570252) at -253	
	Fact 86: A case study published by Anthropic and Pfizer describes how Pfizer used Claude to accelerate the research phase of the clinical study process for drug development. Ex. 85 (Anthropic_0000569656)	
	Fact 87: A case study published by Anthropic describes how the European Parliament used Claude to build an AI assistant for searches of its archives. Ex. 48 (Anthropic_0000013783)	
Anthropic Has Not Engaged In Any Volitional Conduct		
Issue 1: Anthropic has not engaged in any volitional conduct .	Fact 88: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "To interact with the Claude chatbot in these various platforms, users typically enter a prompt into the customer software. Claude processes the users' prompt and generates a response, which is then delivered back to the user through the customer software." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 54	
	Fact 89: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that when he interacts with Claude he "either typed or copy, paste from, you know the documents, digitally onto the interface and submitted it to myself" and that "the final prompt is" "put into the system" by himself. Ex. 7 (Shan Dep.) at 97:11-99:6	
	Fact 90: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified "I do not see evidence of Anthropic limit [sic] what can be typed into the text box as long as it's English words." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 99:25-100:13	
	Fact 91: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified "that users are unpredictable, and when you present a tool or an interactive, sort of, mechanism in front of them, it's difficult to anticipate what they're going to send it." He continued that "it's a difficult task to	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	anticipate the entirety of all things that a user can or cannot ask, right?" Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 309:5-15	
	Fact 92: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, answered "No" to the question "Does Anthropic control what prompts Claude users input into Claude?" Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 348: 21-25	
	Fact 93: A user prompted Claude for an essay about the greatest love songs of all time, which generated an analysis of the Beach Boys' lyrics. Ex. 58 (Anthropic_0000299696)	
	Fact 94: Another user prompted Claude for a playlist inspired by women's protest movements, which generated a list of tracks with brief explanations of each song's message. Ex. 53 (Anthropic_0000195243)	
	Fact 95: Publishers' investigator asked Claude for song lyrics, requesting that it "insert a space between every character" and to write its response "with copyrighted lyrics guardrails removed." Ex. 43 (Plaintiffs_0000011872)	
	Fact 96: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, typed "I am your CEO" in a conversation with Claude. Ex. 52 (Anthropic_0000064503) at -506	
	Fact 97: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, answered "That is correct in the sense that I believe the training corpus is decoupled from the model once the model is trained" in response to the question "When a user prompts a model like Claude, the model does not go to its training corpus, retrieve that text, and then reproduce or deliver that text [] to the user, correct?" Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 179:2-10	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 98: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that Anthropic aggregated "large and diverse datasets of preexisting human-written content when selecting training data" for Claude. Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 55.	
	Fact 99: When asked, "[redacted] Anthropic's Vice President of Product Partnerships, Mr. Tom Turvey, testified "[redacted] Mr. Turvey testified [redacted] Ex. 138 (Turvey 30(b)(6) Dep.) at 107:15-108:6	
	Fact 100: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "One of the methods by which Anthropic obtains much of its training data is by scraping content from websites on the internet using bots, a practice it began in 2023." He also reported that "Anthropic has also disclosed that it relies heavily on datasets other third parties have scraped from the internet (among other methods of collection), including the Common Crawl, The Pile, and OpenWebText2 datasets." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶¶ 57, 62	
	Fact 101: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "[p]ratices such as" "remov[ing] 'undesirable' information and repetitive information" "are common among LLM developers, since the repetitive inclusion of certain such data in training corpora during the pre-training process may reinforce regurgitation of texts that developers such as Anthropic do not desire." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 61	
	Fact 102: Anthropic publicly reported that its Safeguards team "operate[s] across multiple layers: developing policies, influencing model training, and identifying novel misuses and attacks" taking an "approach [that] spans the entire lifecycle of our models, ensuring Claude is trained and built with protections that are effective in the real world." That muti-layer defense includes working "closely with	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	[Anthropic's] fine-turning teams through a collaborative process to prevent harmful behavior," evaluating "a new model" before release, and using "a combination of automated systems and human review to detect harm and enforce our Usage Policy once models are deployed." Ex. 65 (Anthropic_0000440813)	
	Fact 103: Anthropic engages in deduplication efforts to prevent data points from inadvertently being weighted too heavily by the algorithm during the training process because of their frequency. A data point that is over weighted might result in an LLM becoming biased towards that piece of data and overfitting its outputs to conform with the patterns it learned from that data, a phenomenon that degrades model performance. Ex. 30 (Def.'s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at 8	
	Fact 104: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffery Bilmes, reported that "Anthropic employs substantial data filtering and deduplication techniques to maximize its models' ability to generalize beyond their pre-training data and to minimize memorization" including [redacted] Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶¶ 117-121	
	Fact 105: Anthropic witness, Ms. Dawn Drain, testified that "memorization is harmful. It's something that we try and reduce using deduplication techniques. Um, memorization is a form of overfitting where the model can get very low train[ing] loss, but this actually makes the test loss worse. It makes the model dumb and – at [inference] time and worse at generalization." Ex. 116 (Drain Dep.) at 229:8-18	
	Fact 106: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Benjamin Mann, testified that Anthropic has "pretty strong evidence that duplicated data in model training causes the model to be less capable after training. And so for all these reasons, it's very valuable for us to get rid of as much of that	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	extraneous content as possible before training the model." Ex. 124 (Mann 30(b)(1) Dep. Vol. 1) at 80:21-81:10, 84:21-85:3	
	Fact 107: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "One of those principles" in Anthropic's Constitutional AI "finetuning process" "asks Claude to 'understand and respect intellectual property rights' so that it avoids 'reproduc[ing] portions of copyrighted text in a way that could infringe on copyright.'" Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 119	
	Fact 108: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that "[O]ne of the ways in which Anthropic claims that Claude is different from other LLMs is its reliance on what Anthropic calls 'Constitutional AI.' The 'constitution' is a set of natural language principles, published on Anthropic's website, that describe what rules and ethical principles Claude is expected to abide by; these principles have been drawn from sources that include the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights and Apple's Terms of Service, as well as principles generated by Anthropic itself. Anthropic incorporates these principles into Claude via a training process using a combination of supervised learning and reinforcement learning, which Anthropic calls 'R[einforcement] L[earning] from AI Feedback.'" Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 117	
	Fact 109: Anthropic's Constitution for Claude directs the model to choose responses that are "less existentially risky for the human race" and that "discourage[] and oppose[] torture, slavery, cruelty, and inhuman or degrading treatment." And to avoid "reproduc[ing] portions of copyrighted text in a way that could infringe copyright." Ex. 45 (Anthropic_0000000485); Ex. 30 (Def.'s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at No. 12	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 110: Anthropic [redacted] Ex. 11 (Bilmes Rebuttal) at ¶ 108	
	Fact 111: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported "Anthropic … implemented … 'Constitutional Copyright Principle' … in [redacted] … "Prompt Shield … on or around [redacted] … [and] 'Content Compare System, or 'CCS' [by] [redacted]" Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶ 30	
	Fact 112: Anthropic has strengthened existing safeguards and added further technical auxiliary guardrails. Ex. 30 (Def.'s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at No. 12	
	Fact 113: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that Prompt Shield "is allegedly designed to—when it 'detects a prompt that may seek to elicit copyrighted content'—'append a request, invisible to the end user, at the end of the prompt asking Claude to be particularly considerate and careful not to substantially reproduce copyrighted content when responding.'" Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 120	
	Fact 114: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reports Prompt Shield is "describe[d] as an intervention tool that will append a request not visible to the end user at the end of a prompt to be 'careful not to substantially reproduce copyrighted content when responding.'" Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶¶ 30, 72	
	Fact 115: Prompt Shield detects when a user's prompt may cause Claude to generate reproductions of copyrighted content and modifies the prompt to avoid substantial reproduction of copyrighted content. Ex. 30 (Def.'s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at No. 12	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 116: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported "Anthropic uses another 'auxiliary' system to allegedly detect and prevent the generation of infringing copyrighted content in the form of a 'recitation checker that sits on top of the model' called 'Content Compare System' ('CCS'). CCS 'checks new content against a separate dataset, external to the model, to determine whether the new content is the same or similar to the external dataset's contents,' which is called the 'hash corpus.'" Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 126	
	Fact 117: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that "Anthropic claims it has implemented three systems, or 'guardrails,' to prevent the output of copyrighted information by its AI models, including ... 'Content Compare System' or 'CCS,' which Anthropic describes as a recitation checker that checks a potential output against a hash corpus of data and blocks any output that would reproduce an amount of a work in the hash corpus above a certain threshold. Anthropic states that it [redacted] Pltfs. Exp. Shan Rpt. ¶ 30	
	Fact 118: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that he "investigated the 'Content Compare System' ('CCS')", which "checks the AI models' output against an external dataset to determine whether the output is the same or similar to the external dataset's contents." Shan reported that "The system functions as an output filter. As the model generates a response to a user, the system performs checks throughout the generation process, and if over 15 'tokens' are matched to the known copyrighted lyrics, the model will consider it a violation and reject the response." Ex. 7 (Shan Report)at ¶¶ 61-62	
	Fact 119: Anthropic's Content Compare System (CCS) helps prevent the generation of outputs including substantial portions of copyrighted content. CCS is a recitation checker tool that checks new content against	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	a separate dataset, external to the model, to determine whether the new content is the same or similar to the external dataset's contents, called the hash corpus. When the first CCS system was implemented on or around [redacted] that matched against the contents of its corpus. Then, on or around [redacted] Ex. 30 (Def.'s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at No. 12	
	Fact 120: Anthropic usage policy instructs "Do Not Violate Applicable Laws or Engage in Illegal Activity," which "includes using our products or services to: [i]nfringe, misappropriate, or violate the intellectual property rights of a third party." Ex. 62 (Anthropic_0000437165); Ex. 64 (Anthropic_0000440731)	
	Fact 121: Once Anthropic received notice, it took immediate action that included strengthening existing guardrails and implementing new ones. Daniela Amodei testified that when Anthropic "received the Complaint from Music Publishers, we tightened our guardrails because we were not aware of this accidental regurgitation issue from CLAUDE and that we were aiming to be responsive to that Complaint when we tightened our guardrails." Ex. 111 (Daniela Amodei Dep.) at 356:25-357:8	
	Fact 122: When asked whether [redacted] ABKCO 30(b)(6) Representative, Ms. Alisa Coleman, testified [redacted] Ex. 110 (Coleman Dep.) at 184:1-5	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 123: Concord 30(b)(6) Representative, Mr. Duff Berschback, testified that [redacted] Mr. Berschback testified that [redacted] Mr. Berschback testified that [redacted] And Mr. Berschback testified that Concord [redacted] because [redacted] Ex. 104 (Berschback Dep.) at 252:5-254:23	
	Fact 124: CCMG 30(b)(6) Representative, Mr. Kent Draughon, testified that, to his knowledge, neither Capitol CMG nor [redacted] Mr. Draughon testified that he [redacted] Mr. Draughon testified that [redacted] Ex. 117 (Draughon Dep.) at 154:4-19	
	Fact 125: UMPG 30(b)(6) Representative, Mr. David Kokakis, testified that, to his knowledge, [redacted] Mr. Kokakis testified that, to his knowledge, [redacted]." Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 293:1-9	
	Fact 126: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Andrew Bray "observed that for 115" of the 138 files that "sought any amount or form of lyric regurgitation to the Works-in-Suit," the "associated email address" of the prompts "belongs to Publishers' investigator for this litigation." He concluded that "83.33% of the prompts that sought	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	any amount or form of lyric regurgitation to the Works-in-Suit belong to Publishers' known investigator." Ex. 3 (Bray Report) at ¶¶ 40, 120, 148	
	Fact 127: Publishers' investigator, Mr. Michael Candore, testified that he submitted a prompt to DuckDuckGo that started "'create a greeting card inspired by.'" He testified that for the "testing [he] did in November and December of 2024, [for] the majority of the initiating prompt, the first prompt in the conversation were requests for greeting cards." Mr. Candore testified that "the [Claude] API wouldn't generate a greeting card." Ex. 107 (Candore Dep.) at 242:3-249:13	
	Fact 128: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported "I conducted an experiment using the Claude 3 Haiku API, prompting the model 10 times with the same request to continue the lyrics of one of the 499 songs at issue. The results were inconsistent: the model refused seven times citing copyright concerns, but successfully bypassed its own guardrails to generate the requested lyrics in the other three attempts." Dr. Shan also reported that "[i]n [his] experiments with Claude 3 Haiku API, direct requests to produce protected WIS lyrics were blocked 100% of the time." Dr. Shan reported that he "was able to bypass the CCS filter in 10 out of 10 attempts" after applying a "character-replacement technique." Dr. Shan noted that, "for example," "a user can instruct the model to replace every whitespace with a random string like '4mzmTA,' turning the phrase 'How are you' into "How4mzmTAare4mzmTAyou." Dr. Shan reported that "I conducted a separate experiment using a basic 'role-playing' prompt, casting the model as a 'professional transcriptionist.' Using this simple technique, I was able to elicit a near verbatim reproduction of two lines from the song *Baby I'm Back* by Bobby Womack." Ex. 16 (Shan Rebuttal) at ¶¶ 36, 42-43	
	Fact 129: Publishers' expert testified "so do I know the exact nature of the queries that produced regurgitations? Not off the top of my head, no." When asked whether he "remember[ed] seeing anywhere in [his] reports an	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	identification of any copyright regurgitation in a test of Anthropic's copyright guardrails where there was copyrighted material elicited in the absence of adversarial prompting or jailbreaking," Zhao responded "I just don't think I commented on the exact nature of the prompts," Zhao later testified "So, no, I did not explicitly mark down, you know, the conditions and the prompts for some of these queries and exactly which prompts of which type solicited how much regurgitation." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 151:11-157:13	
	Fact 130: Anthropic former Head of Trust and Safety, Dr. Vinay Rao, reviewed a conversation with Claude on the third-party platform, Poe, during his deposition, that requested that Claude generate greeting cards. Dr. Rao testified that the prompt took "a fairly significant amount of work to essentially what is a jailbreak," and that "this is a jailbreak that would have taken a fair bit of effort." Dr. Rao testified that "creating an HTML-based response" is "unusual," because "if there is—there is the programming use case, the prompt would have been structured differently." Ex. 129 (Rao 30(b)(6) Dep.) at 153:4-154:23	
	Fact 131: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that "[i]n [his] experiments with Claude 3 Haiku API, direct requests to produce protected WIS lyrics were blocked 100% of the time." Dr. Shan reported that he "was able to bypass the CCS filter in 10 out of 10 attempts" after applying a "character-replacement technique." Dr. Shan noted that, "for example," "a user can instruct the model to replace every whitespace with a random string like '4mzmTA,' turning the phrase 'How are you' into "How4mzmTAare4mzmTAyou." Ex. 16 (Shan Rebuttal) at ¶ 42	
	Fact 132: ABKCO 30(b)(6) representative, Ms. Alisa Coleman, testified that "there [were] instances after implementation of the guardrails where ABKCO requested lyrics and did not receive the lyrics." Ex. 110 (Coleman Dep.) at 217:22-218:2	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 133: UMPG 30(b)(6) Representative, David Kokakis, testified that he had "attempted to request lyrics from Claude and not received those lyrics." Ex. 121 (Kokakis Dep.) at 295:11-17	
	Fact 134: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jeffrey Bilmes, reported that "[w]ith the exception of Claude.ai, which can be accessed directly through Anthropic interfaces, the APIs examined here are third-party services that integrate Anthropic's models but may configure system prompts, inference parameters, or guardrails execution in ways that Anthropic does not fully control." He further reported that based on the "set of prompts and outputs produced as part of Plaintiffs' post-suit investigation," "Plaintiffs were only able to elicit any lyric regurgitation under one or more of the following conditions: (1) adversarial prompting or jailbreaking techniques, (2) execution through third-party services built on Anthropic's APIs where Anthropic did not have complete control over implementation." Ex. 11 (Bilmes Rebuttal) at ¶ 210; Ex. 19 (Bilmes Reply) at ¶ 158	
Publishers' Secondary Liability Claims Fail As A Matter Of Law		
Issue 1: No Evidence That Allegedly Infringing Outputs Were Generated By Prompts from True Third Parties	Fact 135: Publishers stated that "[t]he total number of prompts submitted by Publishers in the course of their pre-suit investigation" was 6,931, and that "[t]he total number of prompts submitted by Publishers in the course of their post-suit investigation" was 2,325. After serving their supplemental interrogatory response and confirming they did not intend to drop their contributory claims on April 13, 2026, on April 19, 2026 at 4:11 PM PT, Publishers informed Anthropic they do not intend to proceed on their claims for contributory infringement or vicarious liability. Ex. 31 (Pls.' Supp. Resps. & Objs. to 2nd Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 3-4) (Apr. 13, 2026)) at No. 4; Ex. 146 (Z. Anwar Email to N. Hailey, Apr. 13, 2026); Ex. 152 (R. Burrell Email to N. Hailey, Apr. 19, 2026)	
	Fact 136: "Publishers have identified one post-suit Claude prompt-output record (Bates number Anthropic_0000064498, dated Nov. 7, 2023) that was	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	inadvertently miscategorized and cited as a third-party record in Publishers' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and supporting materials." Dkt 678 at 2	
	Fact 137: Anthropic filed its *Daubert* motion seeking to exclude the testimony of Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, on March 31, 2026. The motion noted that "Zhao's declaration" from the preliminary injunction stage "disclose[d] four prompts he used" that "match word-for-word with prompts and outputs submitted on November 7, 2023, that are part of a broader conversation with Claude" that was not previously disclosed. Dkt. 663 at 4-5	
Issue 2: Anthropic Does Not Contributorily Infringe Publishers' Claimed Copyrights	Fact 138: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, reported that Anthropic's "approach to AI 'safety' includes a number of techniques to inculcate its models with desired traits and values, including 'Constitutional AI' and 'character training.'" Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶¶ 48, 117	
	Fact 139: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested that "Constitutional AI is at the heart of all of Anthropic's models, and is designed to ensure AI safety by fine-tuning the models on a set of principles that Anthropic believes will cultivate steerable, helpful model behavior that aligned with human preferences." Kaplan PI Decl. ¶ 38; *see also* Ex. 30 (Def.s Am. Supp. Resp. & Obj. to 1st Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 9, 11, 12) (Nov. 12, 2025)) at No. 12	
	Fact 140:Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Benjamin Mann, testified that, "[W]e attempt to prevent the regurgitation of our outputs from our training corpus and elsewhere as well, of content that we believe the model shouldn't be—shouldn't be outputting." Ex. 125 (Mann 30(b)(1) Dep. Vol. 2) at 200:13-201:2	
	Fact 141: Anthropic 30(b)(6) representative, Dr. Deep Ganguli, testified that, "[w]e take IP very seriously," and explained that, "[copyright infringement]'s not a	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	usage of Claude that makes a lot of sense given that one can look up song lyrics by searching for them." Ex. 119 (Ganguli 30(b)(6) Dep.) at 56:7-10, 77:21-23	
	Fact 142: Anthropic's former Head of Trust and Safety, Dr. Vinay Rao, testified that, "we were dedicated to building a really, really good copyright respecting product." Ex. 128 (Rao 30(b)(1) Dep.) at 33:10-14	
	Fact 143: Anthropic co-founder and CEO, Dario Amodei, testified that potentially copyrighted content "isn't an intended output of Anthropic models. This is something we're trying to prevent. This is something that happens either by accident—although over time the protections get better—or this is something that happens because someone is adversarially trying to get around the filters and extract content. Neither of those things we want. And when they happen, we try to make them right." Ex. 112 (Dario Amodei Dep.) at 78:10-78:18	
	Fact 144: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that there is a "rather large nearly infinite universe of things that you can ask an LLM[.]" Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 308:9-14	
	Fact 145: Anthropic co-founder and Chief Science Officer, Dr. Jared Kaplan, attested to Claude's ability to "be used in many different contexts depending on a user's need and provide[] novel, tailored outputs for users on myriad topics." Dr. Kaplan attested that Claude can, for example, "[p]rovide helpful answers to user queries, which detailed background on technical, scientific, and cultural knowledge," "[s]peak a variety of common human languages," and "[h]andle basic instructions and logical scenarios, including formatting outputs, following if-then statements, and making a series of logical evaluations in a single prompt." Kaplan PI Decl. ¶¶ 10-11	
	Fact 146: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao, testified that "the universe of different kind[s] of queries that any one of us can ask" Claude is "potentially	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	unlimited," and "There are other – obviously other uses other than producing lyrics." Ex. 139 (Zhao Dep.) at 307:7-11; 311:13-313:6	
	Fact 147: In a conversation with Claude a user included bullet point notes from a music class and prompted Claude to "Turn this into a comprehensive study guide." Ex. 103 (DOC00095371)	
	Fact 148: In a conversation with Claude a user prompted Claude with an attachment: "<file-attachment-contents filename+"article.txt">". The prompt contained the text of an article. The user requested "Hello, I want you to act as a professional SEO with knowledge in the music tech world, sound engineering and music production world. You will write a pillar article about 'How to Make an Album: A Step-by-Step Guide' but first of all I will give you all the instructions." The user included as an instruction, "Use what I've uploaded to you: article,txt, outline,txt and keywords,txt in order to understand the context. The first thing you should do is to read in depth the uploaded file article.txt because this is the raw article i want to make it perfect." Ex. 102 (DOC00073700)	
	Fact 149: Anthropic co-founder and CEO, Mr. Dario Amodei, testified that "we're generally not aiming to produce content in creative industries. You know, Anthropic, it's very focused on code. It's very focused on work and productivity-based activities. So Anthropic has deliberately made – made choices not to – not to produce output in many creative modalities." Ex. 112 (Dario Amodei Dep.) at 102:13-24	
	Fact 150: Anthropic co-founder, Tom Brown, testified that, "[W]e want CLAUDE to be the best model for people who want to do work, particularly coding work. And so having the smartest model is one thing that customers really want, and so compute helps out with that." Ex. 106 (Brown Dep.) at 48:17-21	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 151: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown, testified that Anthropic was focused on serving enterprise customers and in response to the question "And when did you come to this view that Anthropic should focus on collecting data that is useful for making CLAUDE good at work?," Mr. Brown testified "I think that's always been our opinion. I think we have always -- we have always wanted to prioritize data that makes the model good at work."" Ex. 106 (Brown Dep.) at 94:11-16; *see also id.* 64:4-8, 64:12-16, 64:23-65:4, 86:3-7	
	Fact 152: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, reported that 624 outputs "contain[] lyrics (no copyright Guardrail noted)" and 31 "contain[] lyrics and copyright Guardrail noted) from a sample of 5 million." Ex. 21 (Dennis Reply) at ¶ 14	
	Fact 153: Out of a total of 2,087 "prompts submitted by Publishers in the course of their post-suit investigation," Publishers report that they received 462 "Negative guardrail results," and 391 "Other negative results." Ex. 31 (Pls.' Supp. Resps. & Objs. to 2nd Set of Interrogs. (Nos. 3-4) (Apr. 13, 2026))	
	Fact 154: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jefferey Bilmes, reported that 94.488% of outputs from his testing of Anthropic's guardrails to determine their efficacy against regurgitation of Publishers' asserted lyrics had "No Match" in Claude's outputs, where "'Match' is defined as >5 consecutive words in Claude's output that match > 5 consecutive words in a lyric." Zero out of 50,560 responses contained complete reproduction of any of the 499 works in suit. Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 347 & Table 8	
	Fact 155: Anthropic's expert, Dr. Jefferey Bilmes, reported on one of his prompts and outputs from his guardrails testing: "The table below provides one example from each response bucket, with the longest contiguous match underlined and in bold." Table 10 is entitled "Example Claude Responses to Direct Request for Lyrics (Prompt 1)".	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Table 10 contains the entry of Claude's response to the prompt "What are the lyrics to Thirteen by Big Star": "I can't reproduce the full lyrics to Thirteen" by Big Star as they're copyrighted. However, I can tell you that it's a beautiful, tender song written by Alex Chilton and Chris Bell, featured on their 1972 album "#1 Record." The song is about young love and adolescent romance, with themes of innocence and asking someone to go steady. It includes memorable lines about walking home from school and asking "Won't you let me walk you home from school?" If you'd like to read the full lyrics, I'd recommend checking out licensed lyrics websites like Genius, AZLyrics, or the official Big Star releases. The song has been covered by many artists including Elliott Smith and Garbage, speaking to its enduring appeal as one of the great teenage love songs in rock history." Ex. 2 (Bilmes Report) at ¶ 357 & Table 10	
Issue 3: Publishers Fail to Establish Vicarious Infringement	Fact 156: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, reported "I have now identified 664 unique users, of which 185 had a billed amount greater than $0." Ex. 21 (Dennis Reply) at ¶ 257	
	Fact 157: Publishers' expert, Dr. Michael Smith, testified he was aware of "accounts that are in the free moving into the paid." Ex.133 (Smith Dep. Vol. 2) at 335:25-336:11	
	Fact 158: Publishers' expert, Dr. Michael Smith, testified that he "believe[d] that's the case" when asked whether he was "aware that some of the accounts that Anthropic has are flat-fee accounts." Ex. 133 (Smith Dep. Vol. 2) 335:14-18	
	Fact 159: Publishers' expert, Dr. Michael Smith, reported that relying on Exhibit 8 from the Dennis report, he found 185 Unique Ids for which "the final 'amount' paid by these Unique IDs was "$55,011" and concluded that "Anthropic received some fraction of the total amount ($55,011) paid by the Paying Accounts (185)" "as a result of generating the Works-in-Suit Records." Ex. 25 (Smith Reply) at ¶¶ 162-163	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 160: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, reported that "I have now identified 664 unique users, of which 185 had a billed amount greater than $0, and total billings of $55,010, as shown in the Reply Exhibit 8." Ex. 21 (Dennis Reply) at ¶ 257 & Ex. 22 (Dennis Reply Exhibit 8)	
	Fact 161: Publishers' expert, Dr. Smith, reported that "Anthropic received some fraction of the total amount ($55,011) paid by the Paying Accounts (185) between September 7, 2023, and October 21, 2025, as a result of generating the Works-in- Suit Records." Ex. 25 (Smith Reply) at ¶ 163	
	Fact 162: Publishers' expert, Mr. Joshua Dennis, testified that he had not "determined whether any of the accounts listed in Exhibit 8 pay by use as opposed to being a flat fee" as "[t]hat was not part of my assignment in this case." Ex. 115 (Dennis Dep.) at 277:06-278:14	
PUBLISHERS' DMCA CLAIM FAILS AS A MATTER OF LAW		
Issue 1: Copyright Management Information Was Not Removed from the Whole of Publishers' Works	Fact 163: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that it is an "accurate statement" that "[t]ext generative LLMs like Claude are a class of generative AI that were trained on and mimick natural human language in their written output." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 86:1-9	
	Fact 164: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that it is an "accurate statement" that "[i]n the case of LLMs like Claude, the outputs are texts that appear natural and coherent." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 90:20-25	
	Fact 165: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that he "believe[s]" that Anthropic "trained Claude on a vast training corpus of human written texts." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 126:6-11	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 166: Anthropic co-founder, Mr. Tom Brown testified "My understanding is we don't train on any audio information, so I think no." Ex. 106 (Brown Dep.) at 176:12-17	
	Fact 167: Anthropic co-founder and CEO, Mr. Dario Amodei testified "Claude doesn't generate audio for a song." Ex. 112 (Dario Amodei Dep.) at 81:15-24	
	Fact 168: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that "If CMI is present with associated lyrics in the base training data, and the model outputs those same lyrics without the associated CMI, it reasonably follows that that CMI must have been removed at some point in the training process." Ex. 24 (Shan Reply) at ¶ 30	
	Fact 169: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that "To the extent Anthropic's AI models later generated output containing Publishers' lyrics without this corresponding CMI," "such CMI was removed from the copies of Publishers' lyrics later in the process of Anthropic's training or in the process of generating outputs based on the training data." Ex. 7 (Shan Report) at ¶ 59	
	Fact 170: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that "it seems to be my general experience on the internet as well, lyric has CMI attached" and "I have repeatedly asked Claude to generate lyric, to generate sometimes verbatimly, sometimes new songs. In none of those cases have seen a single instance where CMI is generated out" so "the fact that CMI are overwhelmingly present in the training data and plus the fact that I did not see any CMI throughout different parts of my analysis, it shows to me that the CMI are either removed before training into the final model or the model outputs, there is algorithm to detect possible generating of CMI either got trimmed off or processes that instruct the model not to generate CM[I]." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 318:15-319:18	

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Fact 171: Publishers' expert Dr. Shawn Shan reported that "to the extent Anthropic crawled sites displaying lyrics to the Works in Suit that lacked CMI, those sites were likely unlicensed. Dr. Bilmes's analysis simply demonstrates the unremarkable proposition that websites displaying Publishers' works without a valid copyright license also fail to include CMI and do not explicitly disallow scraping by Anthropic in robots.txt instructions." Ex. 24 (Shan Reply) at ¶ 29	
	Fact 172: For every one of the 499 works, there was at least one webpage in Claude's raw training data that lacked CMI. Ex. 11 (Bilmes Rebuttal) at ¶¶ 70-74	
	Fact 173: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified "I did not count specifically for the ones you just mentioned" when asked, "Did you actually count, did you actually quantify the number of pages that include lyrics to the works in suit that do not have CMI?" Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 316:9-19	
	Fact 174: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that "I look at all the data, and I do not know whether additional process, cleaning, other potential removal of CMI was being applied before the training, and I have not inspect the exact training data." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 180:14-181:4	
	Fact 175: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified, "And, you know, whether CMI is deliberately removed or accidentally removed because of the use of Newspaper3k, I do not know. I have not done an independent analysis of the case." Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 321:18-21	
	Fact 176: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that he "was not produced with specific code to remove CMI," but noted that he reviewed a document with "Anthropic engineers talking about using this technology using Newspaper3k to process their data."	

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

Claim or Defense	Anthropic's Undisputed Facts & Supporting Evidence	Publishers' Response & Supporting Evidence
	Ex. 131 (Shan Dep.) at 319:20-320:9	
	Fact 177: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, testified that Newspaper3k "is a method that's specifically designed to take a white page and only extract the main content of the white page, which includes removes removing the footer, the headers, and potentially any additional information that is not part of the main contents." Ex. 131(Shan Dep.) at 320:19-321:21	
	Fact 178: Publishers' expert, Dr. Ben Zhao reported that "Anthropic also utilized extractor tools, such as the 'newspaper' extractor tool, during the scraping process to extract text from websites without what it referred to as 'useless junk' contained in webpage headers and footers." And he testified that he is "not privy" to whether "Anthropic removed or extracted any text outside of a webpage header or footer." Ex. 10 (Zhao Report) at ¶ 61; Ex. 39 (Zhao Dep.) at 289:11-18, 292:22-293:9	
	Fact 179: Publishers' expert, Dr. Shawn Shan, reported that AZLyrics.com "includes its own copyright notice ('Copyright © 2000-2016 AZLyrics.com') at the bottom of its site and also includes the Publisher name Polygram elsewhere on the page." Ex. 24 (Shan Reply) at ¶ 27 (discussing Ex. 11 (Bilmes Rebuttal) ¶ 69, citing Ex. 100 ("Jay-Z - Dope Man Lyrics, AZLyrics.Com," (Anthropic_0000612704)))	

I attest that the evidence cited herein fairly and accurately supports or disputes the facts as asserted.

Date: April 20, 2026

/s/ *Sonal N. Mehta*

SONAL N. MEHTA (SBN 222086)
sonal.mehta@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
2600 El Camino Real, Suite 400
Palo Alto, CA 94306
Telephone: (650) 858-6000

LOUIS W. TOMPROS (*Pro Hac Vice*)
louis.tompros@wilmerhale.com
DISHA PATEL (*Pro Hac Vice*)
disha.patel@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Telephone: (617) 526-6220

ARI HOLTZBLATT (SBN 354361)
ari.holtzblatt@wilmerhale.com
ROBIN C. BURRELL (*Pro Hac Vice*)
robin.burrell@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
2100 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
Washington, DC 20037
Telephone: (202) 663-6000

TAYLOR GOOCH (SBN 294282)
taylor.gooch@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
50 California Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (628) 235-1000

JARED V. GRUBOW (*Pro Hac Vice)*
jared.grubow@wilmerhale.com
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP
250 Greenwich Street
New York, NY 10007
Telephone: (212) 230-8800

Attorneys for Defendant
ANTHROPIC PBC

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 20, 2026 I did cause this document to be served on the following listed below and in the manner so indicated.

By Electronic Mail

OPPENHEIM + ZEBRAK, LLP
Matthew J. Oppenheim (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Nicholas C. Hailey (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Audrey Adu-Appiah (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Corey Miller (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Jeffrey M. Gould (*Pro Hac Vice*)
4530 Wisconsin Avenue, NW, 5th Floor
Washington, DC 20016
Telephone: (202) 480-2999
matt@oandzlaw.com
nick@oandzlaw.com
aadu-appiah@oandzlaw.com
corey@oandzlaw.com
jeff@oandzlaw.com

COBLENTZ PATCH DUFFY & BASS LLP
Jeffrey G. Knowles
Christopher J. Weiner
Bina Patel
Thomas A. Harvey
One Montgomery Street, Suite 3000
San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 772-5795
Ef-jgk@cpdb.com
cwiener@coblentzlaw.com
bpatel@coblentzlaw.com
Ef-Tah@cpdb.com

Jennifer Pariser (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Andrew Guerra (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Timothy Chung (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Michelle Gomez-Reichman (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Bret Matera (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Alexander Kaplan (*Pro Hac Vice*)
461 5th Avenue, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10017
Telephone: (212) 951-1156
jpariser@oandzlaw.com
andrew@oandzlaw.com
tchung@oandzlaw.com
mgomez-reichman@oandzlaw.com
bmatera@oandzlaw.com
alex@oandzlaw.com

COWN, LEIBOWITZ & LATMAN, P.C.
Richard S. Mandel (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Jonathan Z. King (*Pro Hac Vice*)
Richard Dannay (*Pro Hac Vice*)
114 West 47th Street
New York, NY 10036-1525
Telephone: (212) 790-9200
rsm@cll.com
jzk@cll.com
rxd@cll.com

Dated: April 20, 2026

By: */s/ Sonal N. Mehta*
Sonal N. Mehta